

An Assessment rubric that SHOULD help to minimise
inadvertent plagiarism

Ursula McGowan
The University of Adelaide
Centre for Learning and Professional Development

ERGA Conference
Assessment that works
Adelaide 20 September 2007

Overview

1. International student assessment
 - Inadvertent plagiarism
 - Difficulties for students and staff
2. Student difficulties with referencing requirements
 - Fundamental reasons not understood
 - Lack of appropriate language for citing
3. Staff difficulties with inadvertent plagiarism
 - Interpreting policy
 - Dealing with cases
4. Two educative strategies
 - Assessment rubrics - rewarding research
 - Genre analysis - helping language development
5. Conclusion
 - Focus on research writing using rubrics
 - The challenge: reduce unintentional plagiarism

1. Internationalisation - student diversity

▪ Some facts

- Demographic fact - international student population:

2006 (Adelaide Uni): 20+% of total student population
2007 still rising 25% ~ target 30 %
(Bain 2007)

- Economic fact - international education dollar
supplements declining federal funds for tertiary sector:

International education - Australia's 4th largest export
income 'worth approximately \$10 billion to the
economy each year' (Bishop, 2007)

2. Student difficulties with referencing requirements

Reasons for referencing requirements

- Not usual in everyday contexts
- Specific to the genre of research

Academic language

- Little help, few (if any) written 'models'
(McGowan 2005)
- Most content given in spoken-style language
(McGowan 2005)
- Warnings about plagiarism but no explanation
(McGowan 2007b)

3. Staff Difficulties with inadvertent plagiarism

- Interpreting policies
<http://www.adelaide.edu.au/policies/230>

 <<Plagiarism not acceptable>>
 <<May occur accidentally>>
 <<Suspected plagiarism incident>>
- Dealing with cases
 Intention to deceive? Or Lack of understanding or skills?
 Punitive strategies? Or educative strategies?

4. Two educative strategies

- Assessment rubrics with specific criteria
 - Support research genre
 - Reward evidence-based writing
- Genre analysis
 - Support language development

Assessment criteria (example)

- Align the assessment **criteria** with the particular **learning objectives** of the assessment task
- Example of 5 possible criteria to **promote good research writing**:
 1. Addresses Topic
 2. Cites refereed journal articles
 3. Critiques internet sources used
 4. Quotations used as evidence
 5. Appropriate referencing

Assessment Rubric: as Guideline for specific criteria and standards

Criteria	Excellent	Satisfactory	Needs work
Addresses Topic	Topic fully addressed	Topic partly addressed	Topic not addressed
Cites refereed journal articles	3 + refereed articles cited	Minimal use of refereed articles	No use of refereed articles
Critiques internet sources used	Internet sources used but critiqued	Some internet sources used uncritically	No critique applied
Quotations used as evidence	Viewpoint based on readings	Some quotes 'speak for themselves'	Quotes without viewpoint
Appropriate referencing	Prescribed referencing	Mixed ref systems	Little or no referencing

English language competence (cont)

- Patch-writing - verging on plagiarism?

Keating (1993) argues that unemployment is 'overwhelmingly, the principal concern of the Government.' While they've been able 'to achieve more economic growth than most other comparable countries', it hasn't been enough to generate sufficient employment. (Keating, 1993). Consequently, the Government's 'strategy is designed to assist recovery in business. Under Labor, business will pay a tax of 33 per cent on profits compared with 42 percent promised by the Opposition' (Keating, 1993). 'There will also be a business allowance of up to 20 percent covering investment over the future two years' (Keating, 1993).

(The University of Adelaide, 2007, p.45)

Assessment Rubric: as Cover Sheet with specific criteria and standards

Criteria	Excellent	Satisfactory	Needs work
Addresses Topic	Topic fully addressed	✓ Topic partly addressed	Topic not addressed
Cites refereed journal articles	3 + refereed articles cited	✓ Minimal use of refereed articles	No use of refereed articles
Critiques internet sources used	Internet sources used but critiqued	Some internet sources used uncritically	✓ No critique applied
Quotations used as evidence	Viewpoint based on readings	Some quotes 'speak for themselves'	✓ Quotes without viewpoint
Appropriate referencing	✓ Prescribed referencing	Mixed ref systems	Little or no referencing

Graduate attributes =Research attributes!

1. Knowledge and understanding of the content and techniques of a chosen discipline at advanced levels that are internationally recognised.
2. The ability to locate, analyse, evaluate and synthesise information from a wide variety of sources in a planned and timely manner.
3. An ability to apply effective, creative and innovative solutions, both independently and cooperatively, to current and future problems.
4. Skills of a high order in interpersonal understanding, teamwork and communication.
5. A proficiency in the appropriate use of contemporary technologies.
6. A commitment to continuous learning and the capacity to maintain intellectual curiosity throughout life.
7. A commitment to the highest standards of professional endeavour and the ability to take a leadership role in the community.
8. An awareness of ethical, social and cultural issues and their importance in the exercise of professional skills and responsibilities.

(The University of Adelaide. 2002)

http://www.adelaide.edu.au/dvca/students/graduate_attributes.html

Graduate Attributes 2 to 8

the basic qualities for **research**:

- ✓ sourcing, analysing, evaluating and synthesising information
- ✓ problem solving
- ✓ collaboration, teamwork and leadership
- ✓ communication
- ✓ the use of technologies
- ✓ awareness of the need for continuous learning and attention to ethical, social and cultural issues.

Graduate Attributes - Research

Research as the defining characteristic of higher education

Undergraduate years as introduction to the culture of research

- Boyer Commission 1998
- Values: use of referencing and avoiding plagiarism

Needs to be made explicit

- language for performing in a research culture

4. English language competence

IELTS - International English Language System

- BAND 6: Competent user. Has generally effective command of the language despite some inaccuracies, inappropriacies and misunderstandings. Can use and understand fairly complex language, particularly in familiar situations.

Genre Analysis for academic writing development

- Cope & Kalantzis (2000)
- Halliday & Hasan (1985, 1993)
- McGowan (2000, 2005))
- Swales (1990, 2000)
- The New London Group (2000)

Language

- Language Learning & Acquisition

Krashen asserts that we acquire language ... by receiving *comprehensible input*, that is, by understanding messages. If the input contains forms and structures just beyond the learner's level of competence in the language, then both comprehension and acquisition will occur...

BUT

comprehensible input is a necessary but not sufficient condition for acquisition (Lightbrown & Spada 1995 p.28)

- Guidance is needed

Genre pedagogy

1. Analyse models of the genre for

- Structure
- Language features
 - Vocabulary
 - Grammatical structures

2. Identify 're-usable' language chunks

Genre analysis - More than word lists:

re-usable phrases, sentence structures, overall structures

Model text:

During the past 40 years the united States has experiences the integration of the computer into society. Progress has been made to the point that small, inexpensive computers are available for innumerable uses...

Re-usable language:

During the past ____ years, the ____ has experienced the introduction of ____ into ____.

Progress has been made to the point that ____ are available for innumerable uses

Weissberg & Buker 1990 p21

Re-usable language

- Literature review (model)
The findings of studies examining the use of various forms of computer assisted instruction (CAI) are mixed. Studies by Hichey(1968) and Honeycutt (1974) indicated superior results, while studies by Ellis (1978) and Caldwell (1980) indicated little or no significant effect
- In a different context and on a different topic, these structures are re-usable:
The findings of studies examining the use of ____ are mixed. Studies by ____ (19xx) and ____ (20__) indicated superior results, while studies by ____ (200x) and Caldwell (200x) indicated little or no significant effect

Adapted from Weissberg & Buker 1990 p21

Re-usable language - focus on research

question

Although much work has been done to date, more studies need to be conducted to ascertain the effects of ____ on ____ in a variety of ____

The purpose of this study was to ascertain the effect of using ____ as compared to a ____ technique in _____

Adapted from:
Weissberg & Buker 1990 p21

Conclusion

- Focus on research writing
 - Use of Rubrics
 - Criteria based on Graduate Attributes
 - Help student language with genre analysis
- The challenge: Try it out
 - If these strategies address the reasons for student difficulties
 - they SHOULD help reduce students' inadvertent plagiarism

▪ References

- Australian Federal Government (2007) *Trade Statement* (released on 13 June). Retrieved 25 July 2007 from <http://www.dfat.gov.au/trade/trade2007/>
- Bain, A. (2007). *Distribution of International Students*. Paper for the Working Party on Interactions between International and Local Students. South Australia. Adelaide: The University of Adelaide.
- Cope, B., & Kalantzis, M.(Eds) (2000). *Multiliteracies. Literacy learning and the design of social futures*. South Yarra, Melbourne. Australia: Macmillan.
- Graduate Attributes (2002). The University of Adelaide http://www.adelaide.edu.au/dvca/students/graduate_attributes.html
- Halliday, M. A. K. & Martin, J. R. (1993). *Writing Science. Literacy and discursive power*. London: Falmer Press.
- Halliday, M.A.K. & Hasan, R. (1985). *Language context and text: Aspects of language in a social semiotic perspective*. Geelong: Deakin University Press.
- International English Language Test Score (IELTS) Handbook (2005). Retrieved September 30, 2006 from http://www.ielts.org/mediacentre/latestieltsdevelopments/1649_IELTSbk_2005.pdf

Lightbrown, P. & Spada, N. (1995). *How languages are learned*. Oxford University Press. Oxford.

McGowan, U. (2007a). Internationalisation of the curriculum: meeting the challenge of cultural diversity. Paper presented at the 2007 HERDSA conference, Adelaide, South Australia.

McGowan, U. (2007b in press). International students: a conceptual framework for dealing with unintentional plagiarism. In T. S. Roberts (ed.) *Student Plagiarism in an Online World: Problems and Solutions*. IGI Global, Hershey, Pennsylvania, to appear.

McGowan, U. (2005). Does educational integrity mean teaching students NOT to 'use their own words'? *International Journal for Educational Integrity*1(1)

<http://www.ojs.unisa.edu.au/index.php/IJEI> (journal)

<http://www.ojs.unisa.edu.au/index.php/IJEI/article/viewFile/16/6> (pdf)

McGowan, U. (2000). Can the writing of theses and research papers be taught generically? Supporting self-help in postgraduates: In: *Making ends Meet. Quality in Postgraduate Research Conference*. Adelaide, 13 & 14 April. Retrieved August 10, 2007 from <http://www.qpr.edu.au/2000/mcgowan2000.pdf>

Swales, J. (1990). *Genre Analysis. English in Academic Research Settings*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Swales, J. (2004). *Research Genres. Exploration and Applications*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

The New London Group (2000). A Pedagogy of Multiliteracies. In B. Cope & M. Kalantzis (Eds.), *Multiliteracies. Literacy learning and the design for social futures*. Melbourne: Macmillan Publishers Australia.

The University of Adelaide (2007) *Communication Skills Guide for Students*. Adelaide: School of Commerce. Retrieved 20 July 2007 from <http://www.commerce.adelaide.edu.au/publications>

Weissberg, R. & Buker, S. (1990) *Writing Up Research. Experimental Research Report Writing for Students of English*. Eaglewood Cliffs N.J., Prentice Hall Regents